Reviewer's report

Title: Epidemiology of dementia and Alzheimer's disease in institutionalized and non-institutionalized elderly people of Durango City, Mexico.

Version: 1 Date: 2 September 2003

Reviewer: Manabu Ikeda

Reviewer's report:

General

This paper addresses an important issue, although the overall scholarship of the paper and the writing leave something to be desired. Authors may wish to consider points described below.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Minor Compulsory Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. Authors used only MMSE cut off point (24/25) for screening dementia. This should be discussed as a limitation of the study.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

2. What is the population in this study? If the subjects is non-biased community-dwelling elderly, it is inconceivable that there is no demented people. Subjects in nursing homes is extremely biased by admission policy of nursing homes.

Advice on publication: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: A paper of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests: None