Reviewer's report

Title: Prospective Open-Label Study of Add-on and Monotherapy Topiramate in Civilians with Chronic Nonhallucinatory Posttraumatic Stress Disorder

Version: 1 Date: 6 July 2004

Reviewer: Lori Davis

Reviewer’s report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct):

This is a well written paper. However, several essential revisions are needed, that I trust you will correct prior to publication.

1. In the discussion, quetiapine is a mentioned and referred to as an "atypical anticonvulsant." this is not accurate. quetiapine is an atypical antipsychotic. As with other antipsychotics, quetiapine has been reported to lower the seizure threshold and case seizures (Dogu et al 2003). please delete this reference or else find reference that indicates quetiapine has anticonvulsant properties.


3. In Figure 1, the labeling is not clear on the y axis. does it indicate bother symptom reduction and response rates simultaneously as indicated. looks like it is only showing symptom reduction. please clarify. also title should read "Mean symptom reduction.... "instead of "Symptom reduction....

4. in Table 4 - is improvement in nightmares for only those reporting nightmares (denominator is 18 instead of 33)? Please clarify.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I have received research grants from OrthoMcNeal, but no personal income or financial gain was received. Otherwise, no stock, financial competing interests nor non-financial competing interests are present.