Reviewer's report

Title: Association study of polymorphisms in the excitatory amino acid transporter 2 gene (SLC1A2) with schizophrenia

Version: 3 Date: 14 June 2004

Reviewer: Dieter Bernd Wildenauer

Reviewer's report:

General
The paper reports a study on association of SNPs in the gene for the excitatory amino acid transporter 2 gene with schizophrenia. Some evidence has been obtained for a SNP in the first intron in one of the two samples with 100 Japanese schizophrenics each, but could not replicated in the second sample.
The study has been carried out carefully, the haplotype block structure in the gene was taken into consideration. LD gaps were detected by LD analysis between the markers and filled by choosing additional SNPs. Hardy Weinberg equilibrium has been checked, nominally significant P values have been corrected by the Bonferroni correction.
The paper is written very clearly, speculations are avoided, results are interpreted almost too cautiously.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

The only suggestion I have concerns the sample size. It should be concluded that 100 individuals are on the lower limit for an association study. Therefore, and also because the gene could be considered as a plausible candidate gene for schizophrenia, it would be desirable to test the findings in a larger sample.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

None