Reviewer's report

Title: Family-based clusters of cognitive test performance in familial schizophrenia

Version: 3 Date: 22 June 2004

Reviewer: I.I. Gottesman

Reviewer's report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached) None --the authors have responded candidly and in depth to my own comments and, in my view, to those of the two other readers. I am impressed with the potential teaching material for peers and students provided by the readers' probing comments and the replies thereto.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. I suggest a specific mention-citation of R.W. Heinrichs 2001 OUP book and a comment about those neuropsychological tests meeting or failing to meet the simple criterion of separating schizophrenics from normals that are also listed in your Tables 3 and 4 (and Fig.). Perhaps an asterisk and brief comment is sufficient.

2. Although Erlenmeyer-Kimling et al. results (e.g. 2000 in Arch. Gen Psychiat.) have been mentioned in previous work by the Ms. authors, it might be appropriate to cite the findings that converge with those here --the traits and trait clusters that distinguished the actual schizophrenic-to-be from other high risk children. Of course the strategy was different and therefore the convergence is all the more interesting.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests: None