Reviewer's report

Title: Defining Mental Illnesses: Can Values and Objectivity Get Along?

Version: 2  Date: 30 November 2013

Reviewer: Peter Zachar

Reviewer's report:

This has evolved into a very nice manuscript.

I have one small suggestion. The DSM wisely, I think, talks about disorders rather than diseases. For many, calling borderline personality disorder a disease will seem odd, and too metaphysically committed. Historically, Jaspers and Schneider also recommended a more limited use of disease talk, especially when considering personality disorders. I would suggest replacing all references to diseases with disorders.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.