Reviewer's report

Title: Yoga for schizophrenia: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Version: 3 Date: 22 October 2012

Reviewer: Donna Ames

Reviewer's report:

I have read the article referenced in the email below, and here are some comments (numbered below) on the article in this email.

(1) I was wondering if the authors included this article that is attached in their meta-analysis.

(2) I am unclear that I understand their methods that they used to re-analyze the data they culled from a number of studies.

(3) I am personally disappointed that their conclusions are not more positive, because exercise of any type is proven to be helpful for schizophrenia.

(4) I wonder if the variety of yoga practices offered was one of the reasons that the results in the meta-analysis may not be valid as there is a bit of comparing apples to oranges when yoga practices have such variability.

Is the question posed original, important and well defined?

(5) Yes

Is the interpretation (discussion and conclusion) well balanced and supported by the data?

The interpretation should discuss the relevance of all the results in an unbiased manner. Are the interpretations overly positive or negative?

(6) Interpretation seems overly negative

Conclusions drawn from the study should be valid and result directly from the data shown, with reference to other relevant work as applicable. Have the authors provided references wherever necessary?

(7) Good references-- could add the study attached.) Are the methods appropriate and well described, and are sufficient details provided to allow others to evaluate and/or replicate the work?

(8) (See above)

Please remark on the suitability of the methods for the study, which should be clearly described and reproducible by peers in the field.

(9) (could be reproduced)
If statistical analyses have been carried out, specify whether or not they need to be assessed specifically by an additional reviewer with statistical expertise. (10) (Yes, statistician would be helpful) What are the strengths and weaknesses of the methods? (11) (Somewhat comparison of apples and oranges due to the different types of yoga utilized and different rating scaled.)