Reviewer's report

Title: Detecting depression among adolescents in Santiago, Chile: gender differences

Version: 2 Date: 25 October 2012

Reviewer: Majed Ashy

Reviewer's report:

This is an important study that fills a gap in literature regarding the suitability of instruments detecting depression and cut-off points for depression in male and female adolescents in cross cultural settings. The abstract is clear and accurately convey what has been found. The questions posed by the authors are well defined. I think the paper is well written. The introduction is comprehensive and explains well what was done in previous research and why this study is needed. However, I think the introduction and discussion can benefit further if it included more examination of acknowledgment of existing literature pertaining to the cross-cultural differences in symptoms of depression. The methods section described in detail the procedure, sample, and instruments. The data analyses used were appropriate and the results are presented and discussed clearly. The discussion is well balanced and is adequately supported by the data. However, I think the discussion could be more informative if it utilized the findings of existing research on gender differences in depression. In addition, a discussion of cultural influences in the design of the study itself (for example, questionnaires vs. interviews, fixed alternative vs. open ended questions, self-reporting vs. observing behaviors) can further raise possibilities for future research in the areas of cross-cultural and gender differences in depression. I think the limitations of the work is clearly and adequately stated and presented. In addition, the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition.

There are no Major Compulsory Revisions or Minor Essential Revisions necessary.

Discretionary Revisions:

1. I suggest that the authors include more of the previous research on cross-cultural and gender differences in depression in both the introduction and discussion.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests