Reviewer’s report

Title: Compulsive carnival song whistling following cardiac arrest: a case study

Version: 1 Date: 23 March 2012

Reviewer: Martien Kas

Reviewer’s report:

This is a very interesting case report on compulsive whistling (for 5-8 hours per day) during an episode of 20 years following cardiac arrest. In addition to the case description, the authors provide some preliminary insight in possible mechanisms via a descriptive EEG observation and clomipramine treatment.

Minor Essential Revisions:
1. The authors describe their EEG findings briefly in relation to neuro-anatomical substrates. No actual EEG data was provided in the manuscript.
2. What was the extend to which neuropsychological examination was performed? The details on their methods used and findings are very limited.

Discretionary revisions:
1. Would it be possible to include some fMRI data from this patient?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests