Reviewer’s report

Title: Service Suspension for Mental Disorders in Armed Forces Draftees in the Penghu Area

Version: 1 Date: 6 January 2011

Reviewer: steven walker

Reviewer’s report:

This was a well written and designed study with scholary conventions followed in accordance with scientific publication. I would be keen to see this paper published especially if the authors could kindly conside the following:

Minor essential revisions:

1. Some grammatical errors should be rectified before publication accepted- suggest proof reading final draft closely.

2. Evidence of ethical approval and confidentiality issues need to be included- how were draftees selected at the point of self-referring to psychiatric services?

3. Limitations of the study shoud be articulated, for example was there cross referencing with claims of previous psychiatric care before military enlistment with draftees family health service in oder to screen out false claims of previous history in order to avoid conscription?

4. Please see attached paper and literature review which contains more recent literature and in paticular evidence from Finland detailing their Armed Forces strategy or pre-screening applicants for military service.

5. Some personal testimony from both the Sg and CG interms of quslitative data would enhance this paper- in particular their attitudes/perceptions to the care and support they curently receive and would like to see provided in future to mitigate the attrition rate.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests'