Reviewer's report

Title: Psychometric properties of the Cardiac Depression Scale in patients with coronary heart disease

Version: 2 Date: 5 November 2012

Reviewer: Jess Fiedorowicz

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:
1) The authors have not adequately responded to the major compulsory revisions, particularly Major Compulsory Revision 1 from Reviewer 1. The last sentence of the results still states the “CDS was more sensitive.”

2) The alternative possibility of the CDS over-diagnosing severe depression also needs to be considered in the discussion.

Minor Essential Revisions:
1) P-values cannot equal to zero although statistical software may round as such. Please replace p=0.000 to <0.001. In Table 3, please drop statistical test for BDI-II since the BDI threshold was used to define the two groups.

2) Limitations section: The phrase “external validity” is misused. The authors could simply replace “to provide external validity” with “to validate.” This limitation is crucial and discussion of which should be further established. We are really not able to evaluate the sensitivity or specificity of the CDS in the study in any meaningful way. We do not know if the CDS is more sensitive as the authors note or is yielding more false positives (which do not improve sensitivity) or, more likely, what combination thereof. Please render this explicit for the reader. In the introduction, the authors discuss how the CDS may be more specific. The data does not test this and, in fact, might suggest otherwise.

3) In line with the limitations discussed herein, the last sentence of the conclusions should be toned down. The authors showed that the CDS generally correlates with some depression anxiety measures and that it has been administered in a new population. However, they should be reluctant to assume this study fully validates the measures.

Discretionary Revisions:
1) The discussion of the results of the factor analysis should be shortened.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests