Reviewer's report

Title: What are the risk factors for the comorbidity of posttraumatic stress disorder and depression? A cross-sectional community study of a war-affected population in South Sudan

Version: 1 Date: 17 June 2012

Reviewer: Derrick Silove

Reviewer's report:

The authors should be congratulated in achieving this well-conducted and large study in a difficult setting.

Major Compulsory Revisions

The main concern is a lack of a theoretical framework to guide the analysis. As a consequence, the findings are "empirical" and based on a rather large set of analyses with risk of Type I error and retrospective interpretation. The authors need to ask themselves what differences a priori would support the proposition that the comorbid pattern is "distinct"?; and what pattern would simply suggest that it is a measure of greater severity of psychopathology? It would seem to me that the combination of high trauma and unemployment/financial difficulties could be one that they test as their main thrust - if so, it could help if the derived an superordinate variable indicating employment/financial duress (which could be related to having multiple wives, not being in the work-force etc). The theoretical considerations at the outset would do much to improve the overall flow of this paper and guide the analyses to avoid simply testing "everything".

The information on training of field workers is scant - particularly since they did use a structured interview for the MINI - any data about inter-rater reliability?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests