Author's response to reviews

Title: The role of Melancholia in Prostate Cancer Patients' Depression.

Authors:

Christopher F Sharpley (csharpley@onthenet.com.au)
Vicki Bitsika (vbitsika@bond.edu.au)
David R Christie (David.Christie@Premion.com.au)

Version: 2 Date: 12 December 2011

Author's response to reviews:

MS: 7260940655938586: THE ROLE OF MELANCHOLIA IN PROSTATE CANCER PATIENTS' DEPRESSION.

RESPONSE TO REVIEWERS' COMMENTS.

Reviewer Monzon: No revisions required.

Reviewer Madeira:

Major compulsory revisions:
We have inserted 33 lines on pp.6, 7 that discuss the issue of somatic symptoms being included in screening of PCa patients, referring in detail to the two references mentioned by the reviewer (Dugan et al, 1998; Passik et al, 2000). Our argument for including the somatic symptoms in our screening of depression of our sample is strengthened by this insertion which lists the somatic symptoms that have been reported in samples of PCa patients (not multiple cancer samples, as used in the two references mentioned).

We have also addressed this issue in the Discussion (as recommended by the reviewer) on page 20 (bold). In fact, we have acknowledged the reviewer’s comment but have argued that the data reported by Hildebrandt et al, (2003) are not easily applicable to PCa patients and that our paper therefore may be seen to make a unique contribution to the literature on PCa depression.

Minor essential revisions:

The quoted paragraph has been deleted and replaced by a new para (pp. 4, 5, in bold) which outlines the historical development of the term “melancholia” and its eventually replacement by “depression” as “melancholia” came to represent a specific subset of depressive symptoms.