Reviewer's report

Title: Massively Multiplayer Online RolePlaying Games: Comparing characteristics of addict vs non-addict online recruited gamers in a French adult population

Version: 3 Date: 1 April 2011

Reviewer: Dave Hayes

Reviewer's report:

While the authors have sufficiently answered most of my questions, there are still a number of related concerns. My main concern is that it seems that the results are still overstated, or are unclear, in many instances. In addition, I have the following comments/questions:

Line 111-12: Are tolerance, withdrawal etc really ‘disorders’?

I’m still skeptical about the use of ‘addiction’ or ‘dependence’ for gaming behaviour, though I recognize that there are many shared facets. Despite the additional text in the introduction, I must admit I’m not entirely clear on precisely how the authors are using these terms – though it seems that they are reserving ‘dependence’ for physical dependence and addiction for the broader behavioural aspects. If so, this would be fine for the present study, however, it should be emphasized that a clear characterization of abhorrent gaming behaviour (and it’s connection, if any, to addiction) is still under review and is thus debatable.

Line 539: I suspect that the higher rates for IA reported here (compared to other literature) may be due to Type I errors related to the many limitations of this study – again, I think it would benefit to point this out.

The manuscript still needs to be corrected for appropriate English grammar and minor errors (e.g. lines 277-280: “How does playing make you feel?” and grated should be greater and fell should be felt). There are many errors such as these, and they often prevent the reader from having a clear understanding of what the authors mean.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'