Reviewer's report

Title: Simulation Studies of Age-Specific Lifetime Major Depression Prevalence

Version: 3 Date: 5 October 2010

Reviewer: Mario Fioravanti

Reviewer's report:

The revised form of the paper seems to be compliant with what one of the referees had asked the authors to do. I cannot judge in detail the technicalities of their methodology but the text looks to me coherent with their aim.

The work looks to me exclusively epidemiologically oriented. They talk of depression but it could have been everything else, and the problem they want to clarify has nothing to do with the clinical technicalities of depression (I would speculate that what they call in general as false negatives could be differentiated in real false negatives, forgetting effect or if you prefer denial effect, and completely and successfully cured cases. Prevalence is what they want to analyze and what factors determine its pattern in different age brackets of the population using real population data in order to organize their simulation procedure. This makes me think of a specific epidemiological problem, not clinical or psychopathologic one