Reviewer’s report

Title: Simulation Studies of Age-Specific Lifetime Major Depression Prevalence

Version: 1 Date: 27 November 2009

Reviewer: Ronald Kessler

Reviewer’s report:

The authors need to cite the well-known Giuffra-Risch paper and explain what’s new in the current paper that was not done in that earlier paper. It's disturbing that Giuffra-Risch was not cited, given that it's such a prominent paper in this area of research and it’s so clearly central to the goals of the current paper.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have written substantive papers on this topic. Patten has previosly written some things that have criticized my work. I have a generally negative feeling about Patten’s work, believing that he's somewhat naive in his conclusions, overly impressed with methodological arguments that he does not completely understand, and prone to making bold critical statements based on faulty logic.