Reviewer's report

Title: The utility of the Historical Clinical Risk -20 Scale as a predictor of outcomes in decisions to transfer patients from high to lower levels of security - A UK perspective.

Version: 1 Date: 21 April 2010

Reviewer: Birgitte Thylstrup

Reviewer's report:

Reviewer's report
> --------------------
> 
> Please number your comments and divide them into
> 
> - Major Compulsory Revisions
> 
> The author must respond to these before a decision on publication can be reached. For example, additional necessary experiments or controls, statistical mistakes, errors in interpretation.

1 Discussion and conclusion need revision and rewriting. The discussion starts off with a rather long introduction, before the actual discussion begins. It is advised to look at the beginning, and see what is necessary, and what could maybe be placed somewhere else. Also the conclusion needs rewriting. The start is unclear, partly because of writing mistakes, and needs clarification. It is not clear what the co-morbidity concerns in the actual article, neither in table 1.

C) Table 2: include percentage beside description of numbers.

> - Discretionary Revisions
>
> These are recommendations for improvement which the author can choose to ignore. For example clarifications, data that would be useful but not essential.
>
> Please note that both the comments entered here and answers to the questions below constitute the report, bearing your name, that will be forwarded to the authors and published on the site if the article is accepted.
>
I think it is a fine article with an important focus. However, taking the major and rather important minor revisions into consideration, it is advised that the authors
respond to the major and minor compulsory revisions before a decision on acceptance is made.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests, BT