Reviewer's report

Title: The 5-HTTLPR polymorphism of the serotonin transporter gene and short term behavioral response to methylphenidate in children with ADHD

Version: 7 Date: 3 June 2010

Reviewer: Varghese George

Reviewer's report:

I read through the most recent version of the revised manuscript, and the reports by Reviewer 4. I believe that analysis performed by the authors using the mixed model approach is adequate and sound. I also tend to agree with the authors that the period x treatment interaction is not really relevant in this study. A power analysis for the sample size used would have been nice, but not really a critical point. The study appears to be not powered enough to detect any significance within females. As the authors mentioned, a larger study with several doses and longer periods of treatment is needed for further assessment of the clinical implications of this study.

I agree with the reviewer of the relevance of testing for HWE for the current study. However, I don't see what further interpretation could possibly be provided! In fact, I believe that authors were really not testing for HWE, rather, they were simply testing for Hardy Weinberg proportions which does not necessarily imply HWE (though HWE implies Hardy Weinberg proportions).

In conclusion, I recommend publication of the article in its current form. I suggest changing "Hardy Weinberg Equilibrium" to "Hardy Weinberg Proportions" in the manuscript.

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.