Reviewer's report

Title: Porencephaly and psychosis: a case report and review of the literature

Version: 2 Date: 27 November 2009

Reviewer: J Wind

Reviewer's report:

- Minor Essential Revisions

> Overall there are significant grammatical errors throughout which would need to be addressed prior to any publication consideration.

Overall the authors attempt to raise the question of whether a congenital abnormality (porencephaly or schizencephaly) could be the etiology of a patient’s one-time psychiatric episode. While an interesting concept, the authors themselves agree that there is no discernment of causation versus association within their article.

This issue is further brought into difficulty by the fact that the authors include in their literature review radiographic findings which may be new onset or progressive, i.e. leukomalacia, versus a known congenital finding. This makes even more tenuous the association between a radiographic finding which has likely been present since birth and a 20 year delay before psychiatric presentation.

Also, there is little discussion of the further workup of the patient with a one-time psychiatric episode. Laboratory analysis, psychiatric history, etc. are all pertinent, before jumping to the conclusion of a possible causative relationship between a congenital abnormality and psychotic episodes.

The authors present an interesting case with an interesting question, but one cannot attest to more than the radiographic findings being an 'incidental finding', and this has been accomplished in the articles already published and cited by the authors.

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited