Reviewer’s report

Title: The Relationship of Bottle Feeding and Other Sucking Behaviors with Speech disorder in Patagonian Preschoolers

Version: 6 Date: 11 September 2009

Reviewer: Peter Flipsen Jr

Reviewer’s report:

A. Major Compulsory Revisions

None.

B. Minor Essential Revisions

The authors have still not told us how the categories of “below normal”, “normal” and “above normal” were defined. Was normal, for example, the mean for the age +/- 1 SD or perhaps +/- 1.5 SD? Or were some set of percentile or standard score cutoffs used?

Specific detailed revisions:

p. 3, 2nd paragraph, line 5– change “four years old” to “four year old”
ibid – line 8 – add “may” before “adversely”
p. 3, last paragraph, line 1 – insert “a” before “family”
p. 4, 2nd paragraph, lines 6-7 – change “for the later” to “of”
p. 5, 2nd paragraph, line 4 – insert “a” before “bottle”
p. 5, last paragraph, line 2-3 – change “this study” to “the current study”
p. 5, 2nd line from the bottom – insert “might” before “influence”.
p. 6, 2nd paragraph, line 3 – omit “the” before “oral”
p. 7, first paragraph – reads “This theory proposes … known as phonological simplified processes.” I’m not sure that Stampe meant that children learn speech primarily by imitation as implied by this sentence. Suggest it be revised to read:

“This theory proposes that during development children produce words in a simplified manner using a group of simplification strategies known as phonological processes.”

Ibid, last two lines – reads “… disorders handle a number of simplified phonological processes than the …” Sounds odd. Suggest changing that to read “… disorders produced phonological processes more often than …”

Ibid, line 6 – change “phonetic” to “speech”
Ibid, line 7 – change “phonetically transcribed and” to “and phonetically transcribed”
Ibid, line 8 – replace “for” with “including changes of”
p. 10, 1st paragraph, line 1 and line 5 – add “occurrence of” after “normal”
p. 11, 1st paragraph, line 1 – delete the word “finger” and insert “breast feeding”
after “other than”
Table 4, 1st column, under Gestation – change “under normal” to “below normal”
Ibid, last column, under Sucked Fingers – insert .03 on the line with Yes (to be consistent)

C. Discretionary Revisions
Page 7, 2nd paragraph – 1st sentence is a bit run on. Suggest ending it at “… test booklet.”. Then change rest to read “Then the examiner tells him/her a standardized phrase that includes the name of the figure and the child is asked to imitate the production.” The phrase “completing a standardized phrase” is odd but could be added if an example of such a phrase were included here.
p. 9, 1st paragraph, line 1 – the phrase “bivariate summaries” seem odd as there are 3 age groups and sometimes 3 levels of the dependent variables. Better to say “Table 1 provides a summary of …” [same for next paragraph]

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.