Reviewer's report

Title: Factors Determining Outcome of Children Hospitalized with Severe Pneumonia

Version: 3 Date: 7 October 2008

Reviewer: Yhu-Chering Huang

Reviewer's report:

Dr Tiewsoh et al enrolled 200 children aged 2 to 60 months with the diagnosis of severe pneumonia to study risk factors for change of antibiotics, prolonged hospital stay and mortality.

Major comments:

1. The conclusion that abnormal chest x-ray were associated with the need for change of antibiotics is quite strange. In my point of view, children with the diagnosis of severe pneumonia should have abnormal chest x-ray. What kinds of children with the diagnosis of severe pneumonia have normal chest x-ray ?

2. The authors should describe the total number of children with the diagnosis of pneumonia during the study period. In what percentage the case of severe pneumonia was. The definition of severe pneumonia should be described clearly in the manuscript.

3. In the study, there were 200 children. Only 30 patients had evidences of bacterial infection based on the findings of blood culture. In this situation, whether changing antimicrobial agents is important for patients. Is there any other data that support most of these children in the study got bacterial infections.

Minor comments

1. What is “head nodding”, more description of the definition of severe pneumonia, altered sensorium

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.