The paper of Prete et al. describes the extensive personal experience of one of the authors on a common endocrinological problem in girls like idiopathic CPP. In this paper the authors describe the patterns of presentation of CPP in 353 girls that were examined during a period of 22 years (1984-2006). The main conclusion of this paper is that the variations in presentation of girls with idiopathic CPP are not explained by factors like age or inheritance.

Major Compulsory Revisions
The authors should make clear how they defined familial CPP. If it is defined by maternal menarche before 11 years of age then it is obvious that it would include those that had menarche before the age of 10.

Why did the authors choose as a cut-off value for uterine length of equal to or more than 34 mm instead of the usually used 35 mm, as in their cited paper de Vries et al did?

In Table 2, from the data presented it is not clear what was the need for the administration of GnRH analogues to infants 1 and 4. An explanatory note should be added to the table.

The authors found that girls with pubertal onset at 3-7 years were taller than those with pubertal onset between 7-8 years, however they do not provide data on bone age and target height in these age groups, so as the reader to get an idea about the girls' growth potential.

Minor Essential Revisions
In the abstract pathologic should change to precocious puberty.

The authors state that girls with premature thelarche (PT) may progress to CPP. To support this they cite the article by Salardi et al. In that study no girl with premature thelarche progressed to CPP, i.e. menarche <10 years. Some girls presented early puberty, probably due to genetic factors, but even in these girls early puberty manifested after breast development due to PT had regressed. Thus these girls presented early puberty and had also a history of PT. In that article it is stated that PT progresses to CPP, obviously copied by the authors, but that is wrong. Therefore the study of Salardi only shows a possible relation between PT and early puberty.

The authors state “girls with premature thelarche may be older or may progress
to precocious or CPP”. This sentence has to be rewritten to make it easy to the reader what they mean.

By definition all girls with CPP have breast development. Therefore in figure 1 the girls should not have isolated pubic hair but just pubic hair development in addition to breast.

Discretionary Revisions

The new guidelines on the definition on precocious development of sex characteristics refer mainly to American girls.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests