Reviewer’s report

Title: Adenovirus type 7 associated with severe and fatal acute lower respiratory infections in argentinian children

Authors:

Guadalupe Carballal (gcarballal@cemic.edu.ar)
Cristina Videla (cvidela@cemic.edu.ar)
Alicia Misirlian (aliciamisir@arnet.com.ar)
Paula Requeijo (prequeijo@hotmail.com)
Maria del Carmen Aguilar (mcaguilar@hotmail.com)

Version: 1 Date: 3 Dec 2001

Reviewer: Dr Tetsuo Nakayama

Level of interest: not specified

Advice on publication: Other (see below)

The paper described the epidemiology of Adeno virus infection among hospitalized children with lower respiratory infection. They isolated 24 strains of Adeno virus and 17 strains were recovered two years later. Among them 14 were identified as serotype 7 and most of them were Adeno 7h. They demonstrated that the fatality rates was 16.7% (4/24) of Adeno virus infection and 28.6% (4/14) of Adeno serotype 7 infection.

The followings are my comments;
1) The data was too old from May 1991 to December 1992 and the study period is too short. They employed virus isolation and antigen detection and did not use a new methods such PCR or hybridization.
2) In the section of Materials and Methods, description of virological methods is too simple. They did not describe the method for serotype identification and the usage of serotype and genotype is obscure.
3) As for the mortality rate, four patients died among 24 Adeno virus infection. In table 2, eight patients (seven of Adeno 7 infection) were not followed and the outcome of these patients was not clearly demonstrated. They accounted for one third of the total cases. These patients should be deleted for the calculation for mortality rate.

In my opinion, the data has little information attributable for the current pediatric practice and the paper is not worth publishing.

Competing interests:

None declared.