Reviewer's report

Title: Exclusive Breastfeeding among Women Taking HAART for PMTCT of HIV-1 in the Kisumu Breastfeeding Study

Version:7 Date:11 September 2014

Reviewer: Suzanne Penfold

Reviewer's report:

Dear Authors,

Thank you for the revised manuscript, which now reads well and is clearly presented. I have a number of further comments on the updated version which I think will make this a more interesting piece of research - please see the attached document for details.

In summary:

Major compulsory revisions

- The paper needs to explore more the findings that relate to differences (or lack of differences) between sub groups of the study population. This is the second part of the aim of the study, which is currently insufficiently discussed. These are also the most interesting (and possibly novel) findings. Without this, the paper mainly reports a descriptive level of EBF in a trial population, which is of limited interest on its own.

- I have suggested some recategorisation of 2 variables in the analysis (place of delivery and time to breastfeeding) that will make the results more relevant for comparison with other research.

- Still more details are needed in the methods about how breast feeding and other variables were measured. How the use of observation versus interviewing mothers and family members was used for measuring each variable is unclear and could greatly affect the validity of the results, even if this is repeating information from an earlier published paper as the details are important for the current study/paper.

Minor discretionary revisions

- Please see the attached document for a few sentences where further numbers need to be added or sentences clarified.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests