Reviewer's report

Title: Comparing early years and childhood experiences and outcomes in Scotland, England and three city-regions: a plausible explanation for Scottish 'excess' mortality?

Version: 3 Date: 9 July 2014

Reviewer: Choon Guan Lim

Reviewer's report:

Minor:

The authors provided several hypotheses following their primary research question/hypothesis under the ‘methods’ section. There was an assumption that the selected childhood outcomes at age 5 and 7 could account for adult poor health; there should be more information provided to support this: for example, some leading causes of poor health and their relationship to these childhood outcomes. These assumptions can be elaborated during the discussion section.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests