Reviewer's report

Title: Inflammatory phenotypes underlying long-term uncontrolled childhood asthma: Rationale and design of the PACMAN2 study

Version: 1 Date: 5 March 2013

Reviewer: Stefan Zielen

Reviewer's report:

I have carefully reviewed the proposal “Inflammatory phenotypes underlying long-term uncontrolled childhood asthma: Rationale and design of the PACMAN2 study”, see attachment.

It is an interesting proposal which aims to investigate inflammatory subtypes of asthma controlled and non-controlled in response to therapy.

The major drawback of the study is the weak definition of long term control. These data rely solely on the information obtained by parents at visit one. This is an enormous weakness of the study. If I understand it right no prospective data are obtained. Therefore the value of the study is rather limited. Parents do not remember correctly all episodes during the previous year. Maybe this can be in part overcome by getting written reports of the physicians.

However if you put rubbish in you get rubbish out.

This weakness can only overcome by an prospective design to define frequent exacerbations in the kids more precisely.