Reviewer’s report

Title: Abernethy malformation: a case report

Version: 4 Date: 4 February 2012

Reviewer: stephanie Franchi-Abella

Reviewer’s report:

Major compulsory Revisions:

Abstract:
Prognosis of patients with CPSS mainly depends of complications (cardio-pulmonary, hepatic) whatever the anatomical type
What is your definition of a symptomatic patient? Is the existence of an hepatic nodule not a complication ? Then the patient should be considered as symptomatic.
What requires liver transplantation is the absence of possibility to close the shunt.

Main text:
Review the name of the figures in the text
At the end of the discussion, once again the patient should be considered as symptomatic and closure of the shunt should be discussed.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests