Reviewer's report

Title: Height, weight and BMI percentiles and nutritional status relative to the international growth references among Pakistani school-aged children

Version: 3 Date: 26 January 2012

Reviewer: Carla Pedrosa

Reviewer's report:

Despite the improvements in the manuscript, there are still several issues to discuss.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Why the results obtained between the WHO and CDC references are statistically compared and with the IOTF they are not? Is the prevalence of overweight/obesity significantly different with the IOTF? (Results section – page 9)

2. What the authors mean by “...means of z scores relative to the WHO reference were closer to zero (and the present sample)...”? (in the Abstract (page2) and in the Results (page 8) section).

3. The authors concluded that “Pakistani school-aged children significantly differed from the WHO and USCDC references but were relatively similar to the WHO reference”, but this is almost nonsense. How can the children be significantly differed to the WHO reference and at the same time be relatively similar? (abstract)

4. In Table 6, the authors added a footnote relative to the smaller number of children (5-10 years) evaluated with the WHO reference. However the same footnote should be presented in table 5 (Height- for-age) and Table 7 (BMI-for-age)

5. As stated above, why the prevalence of overweight and obesity according to the IOTF is not statistically compared to the other two references (Table 8)?

6. In Table 9, thinness/wasting are defined by <-2SD BMI-for-age z score, witch is not correct. BMI-for-age z score should be used to assess thinness, while to assess wasting weight-for-height z score should be used. BMI is calculated by weight(kg)/ height square(m) which is not the same as weight-for-height.

7. In Figures 1 to 6, the age should be presented in Years in order to facilitate the interpretation.

8. In Figure 3, it seems like boys starting at age 10 stabilize in BMI while girls continue to rise. Also, in the lower percentiles boys seem to decrease in their BMI. In Discussion, the authors refer to the earlier pubertal growth spurt in girls, however at 12-13 years-old boys also initiate puberty. Please explain.
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.