Reviewer's report

Title: Early eczema and the risk of childhood asthma; a prospective, population-based study

Version: 1 Date: 23 April 2012

Reviewer: Caimmi Silvia Maria Elena

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions
1) This manuscript considers a large cohort of patients with eczema at age 2 years, with the aim of studying the risk of developing asthma and allergy coexisting at the age of 6 years. The authors' interest is to test the hypothesis of an atopic march in the general population, however, the considered population is not general, but a group of children already affected by eczema.

2) The structure of the article makes interpretation difficult: the results and discussion are reported before methods and statistics.

3) All the study relies on the answers of parents of detailed questionnaires on the child's health. Thus it is difficult to make a diagnosis of asthma or wheezing, which may be due to viral infections, very frequent in the age group considered and which are not associated with the atopic march.

For these reasons the conclusions are not supported by reliable datas or objectives datas.

After reading the manuscript I have not learnt anything new.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests