Reviewer’s report

Title: Nutritional status and HIV in rural South African children

Version: 4 Date: 5 May 2010

Reviewer: Alice Tang

Reviewer’s report:

I still do not agree that an independent t-test is appropriate to use for testing the difference between 2 groups that are not independent. I understand that they are not matched, but they are definitely not independent. It doesn't make sense to do this statistical comparison because there is such a large overlap in the two groups - the data are essentially the same for 612/671 participants.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests