Reviewer's report

Title: Health State Preferences Associated With Weight Status in Children and Adolescents

Version: 1 Date: 20 December 2010

Reviewer: Holly Felix

Reviewer's report:

This is a very well written paper but is lacking in its discussion of findings with the current literature. You suggest that you are the first to report health utilities of obese children. However, you also discuss the Apple Study. It seems that the baseline HUI for participants in that study would be the first reported health utilities in obese children. You need to discuss your findings in relation to their baseline findings.

See also, deBeer and Gemke chapter, Health-Related Quality of Life in Obese Children and Adolescents in Handbook of Disease Burdens and Quality of Life Measures, 2010.

Page 4. In the Health Status and Utilities Section, remove second “provides” from sentence starting “An advantage of the HUI over many other instruments…”.

Page 4. Use of Health Utilities Index with children…it is validated for use in children as young as 8. Provide more detail about this measure and its use in children. And, explain why you did not use it with children 5-7 years old?

Page 9, not sure comparison of utilities in children and adults should be compared. Is there some support in the literature for comparing adult to children utilities?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

declare that I have no competing interests