Reviewer's report

Title: There is (still) too much aluminium in infant formulas

Version: 1 Date: 3 June 2010

Reviewer: Frank Greer

Reviewer's report:

Major Points: It is not clear what this paper contributes to the literature since the aluminum concentration has previously been reported in infant formulas and shown to be high. The authors do not offer a convincing argument that this "excess" of aluminum is harmful, so why would the formula companies take an interest in altering their products? What government regulatory agency makes any rules or shows concerns for the Al content of infant formulas? In addition, since these formulas are limited to the UK, is this study generalizeable to other countries?

Minor Points:

1. What is THGA?
2. Were there any breast milk controls? What is the AL content of breast milk in the UK?
3. Page 3, first three lines. Please reference this statement.
4. Page 4, top. It would seem that a third category of formulas is included in this paper--'growing up formulas' for greater than 12 months.
5. Page 4, first paragraph under results. If the liquid formula was well shaken, how could there be inhomogeneous distribution of Al?
6. Page 6, last 8 lines. There is a clear link with parenteral nutrition and harm from Al, but there is no clear link between formula AL and harm to infants. If there is no link to harm, why would formula companies try to decrease the Al content given how hard this would be.
7. What is the Al content of commonly fed complementary foods in the UK?
8. Page 7, conclusion. "Burgeoning evidence" is an over statement. And again, does any government agency think Al content of infants formulas is health problem?
9. Table 3. Should more closely resemble Tables 1 & 2 and include a range of Al ingested from products in a 24 hour period.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I have no competing interests.