Reviewer's report

Title: Clinico-epidemiological profile and diagnostic procedures of pediatric tuberculosis in a tertiary care hospital of western Nepal- A case-series analysis

Version: 1 Date: 25 January 2010

Reviewer: Alwyn Mwinga

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The article provides a retrospective analysis of pediatric TB cases diagnosed between March 2003 and June 2008. The abstract does not provide adequate information on the topic under discussion. A major weakness in the article is the lack of statistical analysis though phrases such as statistical significance are used for the difference in pulmonary TB and extrapulmonary TB among the age groups. Statistical analysis is required to support the statements made in the paper.

2. The discussion has many repetitions and is not very easy to follow. The discussion on the impact of HIV occurs in two paragraphs and these seem to contradictory.

3. It is not clear what is meant by BCG diagnostic. The sentences describing the Mantoux and BCG are not clear.

4. The conclusions are not supported by the data presented e.g. extrapulmonary manifestations said to outnumber pulmonary, though the data presented show the opposite (75 pulmonary, 68 extrapulmonary).

Minor Essential Revisions

Abbreviations should be spelled out the first time they are used e.g. FNAC

Tables are wrongly quoted in the body of the paper – reference to figure 1 when there is no figure 1, distribution of types of TB said to be in Table 1 when it is actually table 2, the table showing investigations is Table 3 and not table 4..

Figures wrongly quoted – in text 75 patients diagnosed with extrapulmonary TB but in table it is 67.

- Discretionary Revisions

1. Review use of some phrases such as “gamut of investigations, battery of investigations” as only 5 investigations quoted in study.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.