Reviewer’s report

Title: Painful vertical diplopia as a presentation of a pituitary adenoma

Version: 1 Date: 20 September 2006

Reviewer: An-Guor Wang

Reviewer’s report:

General
This is an interesting case report of pituitary tumor with initial presentation of painful vertical diplopia. However, there are several points that the authors should clarify in their manuscript.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
1. The authors should add the coronal MRI of this tumor in the article. Whether this tumor did invade/compress the right cavernous sinus or not should also be delineated and discussed in the manuscript.
2. Please discuss the possibility for coincidental occurrence of a silent pituitary tumor with a spontaneously recovering micro-infarctive oculomotor nerve palsy.
3. Please explain the possible mechanism of how the pituitary tumor compromise the vascular supply of the oculomotor nerve, and specify which vessel it is.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
4. The description of the tumor size is ambiguous that “intracranial imaging delineated a 4cmx3cm cystic pituitary mass…. There was enhancement of the tumor itself measuring 1.72cm x 1.28cm x 1.29cm…” Please explain why the size of the ring enhancement (which seems to be surrounding the tumor on figure 2) is smaller than the 4cmx3cm cystic pituitary mass.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests