Reviewer's report

Title: Comparison of silicon oil removal with various viscosities after complex retinal detachment surgery

Version: 1 Date: 16 March 2006

Reviewer: Peter Wiedemann

Reviewer's report:

Even though silicone oil proved to be a very useful tool the question of the preferred silicone oil viscosity remains unanswered. The advantage and disadvantage of different viscosities is well discussed in this manuscript.
In this study the outcome of successful complex retinal detachment surgery following removing silicone oil of two different viscosities, 1000 and 5000 cs, was evaluated. The redetachment rate was significantly higher and the functional outcome poorer in the 5000 cs eyes. The authors discuss that this may be due to the earlier removal of 1000 cs oil due to earlier emulsification. A randomized trial should solve the question whether this is due to earlier removal or different viscosity.
I think this is an interesting observation and a good retrospective study which opens important questions such as the origin of central scotomas associated with intracocular silicone oil (Graefe 2/2006).

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No