Reviewer's report

Title: p21 gene codon 31 polymorphism is not associated with primary open angle glaucoma in Caucasians

Version: 1 Date: 22 February 2005

Reviewer: Henri-Jean J Garchon

Reviewer's report:

General

This is a negative report on a coding polymorphism of the p21/WAF1 gene in susceptibility to primary open-angle glaucoma in Caucasians. The variant was previously associated with the disease in the Chinese population. The gene is also a candidate in current attempts of gene therapy in POAG.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The authors should specify that the allele frequencies follow Hardy-Weinberg proportions.

The assertion toward the end of the discussion that the low frequency of the Arg allele in Caucasians likely implies a small effect on the pathogenesis of POAG is wrong and should be removed. There is no predictable relationship between the allele frequency and the magnitude of the effect: in Mendelian diseases, rare mutations have a strong effect.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.