Reviewer's report

Title: Primary Graft Failure Associated with Epithelial Downgrowth: A Case Report

Version: 2 Date: 15 February 2005

Reviewer: Cornelia M Mooy

Reviewer's report:

General:

This is a report of an extraordinary case of primary graft failure with epithelial downgrowth with review of the literature.

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Abstract: case presentation: line 5-8: should mention the histopathologic result of the initial host button (no epithelial downgrowth), followed by that of the failed corneal graft. Delete line line 6-": DNA...graft. Conclusions: is speculative: no definite proof.

page 7: Results: line 11-12: cut and paste after line 3, after ...dystrophy.

Discussion: page 8, lines 12-14: comment: full thickness suture has been performed during the previous cataract surgery. In figure 2 the cataract scar does not seem to be completely excised. Reactivation of an entrapped island of epithelium from the deeper (not excised) part of the cataract scar may have been the source of the epithelial downgrowth. Please make a comment on this issue.

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

abstract: background line 4: primary corneal graft: add (PGF)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.