Reviewer's report

Title: Comparative evaluation of diode laser versus argon laser photocoagulation in patients with central serous retinopathy: A prospective, randomized clinical trial

Version: 1 Date: 22 August 2004

Reviewer: Scott E Brodie

Reviewer's report:

General

Verma et al report their findings in a small randomized clinical trial comparing the infrared diode laser with argon green laser in the treatment of central serous retinopathy. They argue that the diode laser is better suited to treating this condition as it better delivers energy to the deeper choroidal vessels which are the likely primary locus of the disease. They find more rapid recovery of visual acuity, better recovery of contrast sensitivity, and freedom from paracentral scotomas at the laser treatment site with infrared diode laser compared with argon green laser treatment.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

None

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. Please include statistical p-values with the results in the Abstract.

2. p 8: The comparison of the frequency of residual scotoma at 4 weeks between diode and argon laser treatment is described as "statistically significant (p<0.5)". Presumably the p-value has been mis-typed. Please correct.

3. There are numerous instances of poorly idiomatic English throughout the paper. Revision by a fluent speaker of English would be appropriate.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

1. The Discussion section needlessly repeats many of the Results, including the p-values. This repetition should be eliminated.

2. p 12. The discussion of the cause of recurrent CSR is not relevant to the findings of the present study and should be omitted. The study does not address recurrence of CSR, and the speculation as to a likely more favorable result with diode laser should be omitted.

3. p 13. The economic advantages of diode laser are just as much of concern in first-world as in third-world countries!
What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
None