Reviewer’s report

Title: Amniotic membrane transplantation as additional therapy in patients with aggressive Mooren’s ulcer

Version: 1 Date: 5 November 2013

Reviewer: Nicholas Colatrella

Reviewer’s report:

Overall great paper that I really enjoyed reading and look forward to its publication.

Here are some Discretionary Revisions:

1. Discussion:
During the introduction on the fourth page you talked about Ngan et al’s retrospective study of 18 eyes who stabilized after being treated with AMT and then about Chen et al and Zhou et al’s contrasting results, (references 13,14,15). In your discussion you did a fantastic job of talking about the different categories of Mooren’s and how you found differences in the more aggressive forms. Similarly, I think it would be nice to hear a little more about how your study differed from those previous case reports of AMT and why you think your cases did not benefit from AMT therapy.

2. Conclusion:
Your overall question for the paper was to shed more light on the optimal treatment of severe progressive Mooren’s. Perhaps a statement in the conclusion that is based on your case series stating that there is no optimal treatment for Mooren’s, would be appropriate (indirectly you refer to this but do not say it in text).

3. Title:
Good title, but I’m not sure if it truly conveys the outcome of the case series. When I first read the title I assumed it was further evidence supporting the case that AMT would be effective for Mooren’s patients and honestly would have probably stopped there. Therefore, I would consider adding something to the title to convey the fact that AMT is ineffective. Such as “Amniotic membrane transplantation ineffective as additional therapy in patients with aggressive Mooren’s ulcer”.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'

Disclosures:
Consultant to BioTissue and IOP Ophthalmics