Reviewer's report

Title: Effectiveness of intravitreal ranibizumab in exudative age-related macular degeneration (AMD): comparison between typical neovascular AMD and polypoidal choroidal vasculopathy over a 1 year follow-up.

Version: 3 Date: 13 December 2012

Reviewer: Takashi Ueta

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript by Dr. Matsumiya is very well written from the viewpoints of its purpose, design, data composition and conclusion. Because it has not been clearly understood whether effectiveness of ranibizumab may be different depending on its subtypes of wet AMD, the provided information can be important. This is especially so when there has been a report of similar design, but with opposite results (Am J Ophthalmol 2012;154:125-36).

1. Page 2. In the method section, the design of the study, retrospective cohort, should be explained.

2. Page 6. "no comparative studies have not been published on the effectiveness of IVR associated with these different phenotypes of AMD" should be corrected because of the previous report in AJO as well as the author's previous report (J Ophthalmol 2011;2011:742020).

3. In the discussion section, several limitations such as relatively small sample size or retrospective design should be mentioned.

As a reviewer, I recommend an accept with revision.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests.