Reviewer’s report

Title: Atypical Vitelliform Macular Dystrophy Misdiagnosed as Chronic Central Serous Chorioretinopathy: Case Reports

Version: 1 Date: 29 February 2012

Reviewer: Dimitrios A. Karagiannis

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript is from clinical interest as vitelliform macular dystrophy may be misdiagnosed. However, there are some points which are not clear enough. For example:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Since the disease was prolonged how do the authors explain the good visual acuity?
2. Based on fundus pictures it is reasonable to say that this patient has either end stage VMD or prolonged chronic CSR which both have low vision.
3. Further imaging is needed. For example late frames of ICG. These may exclude the coexistence of chronic CSR if there are no areas of hyperfluorescence which do not correlate with the areas of hyperfluorescence in FFA.
4. How do the authors explain the presence of subretinal fluid?
5. It is mentioned that SD-OCT was performed. Please provide such pictures to see more in detail the findings (especially layers IS/OS) and compare it with the initial stratus OCT. This also may explain good V/A.

Discretionary Revisions

6. Also has to be mentioned if there was any refractive shift at presentation and if this has changed during the follow-up period

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that have no competing interest