Reviewer's report

Title: Isolated Sixth Cranial Nerve Palsy as the Presenting Symptom of a Rapidly Expanding ACTH Pituitary Adenoma: Case Report

Version: 1 Date: 10 November 2010

Reviewer: Fatih Tanriverdi

Reviewer's report:

In the manuscript by Saffra et al. a case with isolated sixth cranial nerve palsy due to rapidly expanding ACTH positive pituitary adenoma was presented. The case is interesting and clinically relevant but I have several concerns.

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1. In background section line 8 the authors described the adenoma as “…rapidly expanding ACTH secreting tumor without apoplexy.” However I could not find any clinical description or any hormonal profile regarding Cushing’s disease in the paper. Therefore the authors should include the following important details in the manuscript. A) Did the patient have any clinical features of hypercortisolemia? B) Did the authors perform any hormonal test (ACTH level, cortisol level, 24 hours urinary cortisol level, dexametason suppression test etc…) for the diagnosis of Cushing’s disease? C) If there is no clinical and/or hormonal evidence of hypercortisolemia the authors have to describe the pituitary adenoma as “ACTH positive silent adenoma” instead of “ACTH secreting adenoma”.

2. The title also need to be revised as”….. ACTH positive pituitary adenoma..” instead of “..ACTH adenoma…..”

3. In case presentation section the authors did not mention the pituitary hormone status of the patient. The preoperative values of thyroid function, prolactin, IGF-I levels are warranted to comment on the functional status of pituitary adenoma.

4. What about the menstrual history of the patient? If the patient is postmenopausal FSH/LH levels are the only way to understand gonadotropin deficiency due to adenoma compression to the normal gland.

Discretionary Revisions:

1. If possible it would be better to add the final enlarged dimensions of the pituitary adenoma before surgery.

2. In discussion section it would be better to add the clinical and radiological differences of pituitary apoplexy and rapidly growing adenoma.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'