Reviewer's report

Title: ADAM33 gene silencing by promoter hypermethylation as a molecular marker in breast invasive lobular carcinoma

Version: 1  Date: 30 October 2008

Reviewer: Gulnur Guler

Reviewer's report:

There are small spelling errors throughout the paper: In abstract: RE : ( should be replaced with ER, RP: ( should be replaced with PR,
Introduction: mesenchymal: mesenchymal

Also it is more convenient to give open terms of ILC and IDC in the abstract.: ILC: Invasive lobular carcinoma, IDC: Invasive ductal carcinoma

Methods: The clinicopathological features of the study group needs to be detailed. Did you use frozen tissues? Did you reevaluate morphological features such as histological type, grade or you receive clinicopathological data from the records?

Are the results for ER, PR and cerbB2 from immunohistochemistry? What is cutt of values for negative and positive status? Is cerbB2 data from immunohistochemistry or combination of immunohistochemistry+FISH and what is the description of positive status?

Results: The authors explain presence of low level of transcription in one of the highly methylated cell line (MCF 7) by importance of methylation at critical CpGs. But besides this, other epigenetic changes such as histone modifications may have a role in complete gene silencing. We also know sometimes different inactivation mechanisms may be effective for the same gene: one allele methylated, other one lost; one allele mutated other one methylated… These possibilities should be included in discussion

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests