Reviewer’s report

Title: Role of loss of full length CtBP1 expression in malignant melanoma

Version: 2 Date: 10 September 2008

Reviewer: Thirugnana Subramanian

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript entitled, ‘Role of loss of full length CtBP1 expression in malignant melanoma’ by Winklmeier et.al. is an interesting piece of work to understand the role of CtBP1 in melanoma. Before its acceptance for publication, several questions have to be addressed.

Major Compulsory Revisions.

(1). What expression vector was used for the expression of CtBP1?
(2). A control human melanocyte cell has to be included to show that the splice variant is missing in these cells.
(3). Proliferation, colony formation and invasion assays, there was no data presented. It is very important to include invasion assay result that is very critical for the strengthening of the manuscript.
(4). In Fig.4, out of 3 CtBP1 expressing cell lines only one cell line is used in this figure. It is necessary to use all three cell lines. In addition, the CtBP1 level is very low. The blot has to be exposed for longer time to show higher level of CtBP1, and then only it can be ruled out that the splice variant is not interacting with TCF4 or snail.
(5). Figure legends and Table legends have to be self explanatory and so they have to be written clearly. Without legends the results are confusing.
(6). In both Fig1 and 4 the blots were carried out for CtBP1. Why two different percentages of gel (8.5 and 15%) were run in these experiments?
(7). Finally, some minor corrections are there in Background (line 14 could show to be corrected as showed) and Results (paragraph 1 line 1 could show to be corrected as showed; paragraph 2 line 5 delete could.