Reviewer's report

Title: Regulation of MCP-1 secretion in a novel bone-tumor coculture model

Version: 1 Date: 10 September 2008

Reviewer: Nicola Normanno

Reviewer's report:

The paper by Schiller et al. describes a novel tumor-bone co-culture model that might be useful to investigate the mechanisms involved in the formation and progression of bone metastases and to develop novel therapeutics. However, additional experiments are required to better characterize the regulation in this system of MCP-1 secretion, which is the main topic of this paper.

Major Compulsory Revisions:

- Completely different results were obtained by using three different models. Co-culture of fibrosarcoma mouse cells (NCTC 24729) with bone led to an increase of MCP-1 secretion, co-culture with mouse osteosarcoma K7M2 cells produced no change, and co-culture with MDA-MB-231 human breast carcinoma cells resulted in a reduction of MCP-1 levels. The authors need to explore the effects of co-culture in additional sarcoma and breast carcinoma cell lines to assess whether the difference that they found is tumor-specific.

Discretionary Revisions:

1) The description of the experiment represented in Figure 3 as well as the figure legend are quite confusing and difficult to read

2) When referring to the different cell lines in the text and in the figure legends the specific names should be used

3) The introduction and the discussion are too long. The paragraphs related to bone pain should be omitted or significantly shortened.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No competing interests