Reviewer's report

**Title:** Cadmium Burden and the Risk and Phenotype of Prostate Cancer

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 17 November 2008

**Reviewer:** John K Gohagan

**Reviewer's report:**

**Major:**

The authors should add substantial detail on quality control at every step from collection to analysis of samples and on the validity of the version of the food frequency questionnaire actually used.

The authors should review the following two prior publications on the subject and explain the contrasting results. These two papers represent the current evidence base for negative findings in the NCI's PDQ Prostate Cancer Prevention Statement.


**Minor:** There are several editorial points needing attention. Very careful rereading of the text will reveal residual words from prior versions of sentences that in the current text are not relevant and cause the reader to stumble when reading. Also, statements throughout the text that seem to refer to prior work by others need citations to assist the reader in determining the source of the information.

**Discrete:** I'll mention only one, but while working through the minor revisions needed, the authors may find and correct others. The one that I here mention would be useful informative point in the Background section. It is probable that prostate cancer screening is the primary cause of the mentioned 3-fold increase in incidence in the 1990s and that screening is more common among wealthier men.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.

jkg