Reviewer's report

Title: Gastric cancer surgery: Billroth I or Billroth II for distal gastrectomy?

Version: 2 Date: 14 September 2009

Reviewer: Jianhui Cai

Reviewer's report:

# Discretionary Revisions:
In the methodology, 809 cases of the patients should be classified by clinical stages so that the readers can easily understand the operation choice in the presented data.
The reply is: The authors described the clinical classification of their patients according to the extent of malignancy, based on POSSUM system.
Re-review: The POSSUM system should be described in detail in the manuscript, so that the readers could better understand.

# Minor Essential Revisions:
1. On the foot note of Table one, the author noted that “* including recurrent gastric cancer”, but in the table, there is no label of “*”, so that making readers confused that the “recurrent gastric cancer” was included in which group of the patients.
The reply is: we have omitted it.
2. Table 2, the meaning of hemorrhage “deep” is inexplicable.
The reply is: Actually deep hemorrhage attributes to intra abdominal hemorrhage which needs reoperation to stop it, according to standard definition of POSSUM. we have amended the standard definition of POSSUM complication in appendix section.
3. English statements should be further corrected by a native speaker. Please take care of the wrong use of words or sentence and the use of singular and plurality.
The reply is: I have had this manuscript edited by a native English speaker according to your suggestion.

# Major Compulsory Revisions:
Table 2, the meaning of hemorrhage “deep” is inexplicable. Please make sure that it was “deep” alimentary tract hemorrhage or a “deep” hemorrhage in wound.
The reply is: The definition of deep hemorrhage is defined by POSSUM system and we have amended this data in appendix section, which generally attributes to intra abdominal hemorrhage which necessitates reoperation to stop it.

Re-comments:
The authors have made a modification of their manuscript in detail. I think the
manuscript is now publishable.