Reviewer's report

Title: Identification of colorectal cancer patients with tumors carrying the TP53 mutation on the codon 72 proline allele that benefited most from 5-fluorouracil (5-FU) based postoperative chemotherapy.

Version: 2 Date: 13 October 2009

Reviewer: John T Plukker

Reviewer's report:

Major revisions.

Although the authors have changed the manuscript in a positive way it is still difficult to read.

One of the main problems is that the authors should concentrate more strictly to the subject on CRC and the question itself, which they should define more clearly.

Particularly, the introduction, de facto the last part from "Furthermore ....HNSCC, and also the discussion should be shortened considerably.

Another problem is that the text, tables and figures should be ordered with the correct number of patients/cases. There seems to be some miscalculations. Some examples: in the abstract (results page 1) TP53 mutation....148 should be 149

Others: page 5 Results, subject TP53 mutations of the tumours Table 148 is not corresponding with 157 in fig 1. Also in the next session TP53 codon 72 status on the fifth sentence, 211 informative CRC (n= 212, one pt is missing)

Fig 1a TP53 n=147 not 157 fig 1b mutation on Arg 94 in stead of 69 the same for on pro 55 in stead of 40, fig 1 c n=46 , but there are 63 heterozygous genotypes etc. Please check the number of patients/cases in the tables, text and figures.

The discussion section could be reduced; the authors should be stressed more on their subject and question.

There are still spelling mistakes.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.