Reviewer's report

Title: Predicting Prognostics in Hepatocellular Carcinoma after Curative Surgery with Common Clinicopathologic Parameters

Version: 2 Date: 3 February 2009

Reviewer: Hans Spangenberg

Reviewer's report:

The paper by Hao et al. describes prognostic factors in HCC after curative surgery. Even though the authors state that their system is superior to the classification systems published so far (CLIP, Barcelona, GRETSCH, Okuda, etc.) the factors found in their study are in most cases already well known and evaluated. Therefore the authors of this study should definitely demonstrate the differences of their findings in comparison to the known classification and predicting models published so far. A table in which the factors are compared should be incorporated to better understand the superiority of their prediction system. Furthermore the evaluation of the system should be done in a prospective study. otherwise the study is well written and the methods used are standard.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests