Reviewer's report

Title: Predicting Prognosis in Hepatocellular Carcinoma after Curative Surgery with Common Clinicopathologic Parameters

Version: 2 Date: 29 December 2008

Reviewer: Li Zhou

Reviewer's report:

I. General comments

The authors first develop a predictive model for post-resectional survival of hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) by incorporating many clinicopathologic parameters, based on a large cohort of HCC. Then the model is confirmed to be highly predictive in another cohort. Similar survival predictive system using such comprehensive clinicopathologic parameters has not been found in previously published literatures, to my best knowledge. Therefore, this paper seems to be of originality. Besides, the data are well organized to get a reasonable conclusion, and the manuscript is well written.

II. Specific comments

These issues should be addressed.

1. Title
   The word “Prognostics” can be changed to “prognosis”, according to the usual statement.

2. Study Subjects
   The initial training dataset includes patients between 1993 and 2007, whereas the independent cohort for validation enrolls patients between 1990 and 2004. If and how many patients in these two cohorts overlap each other should be clearly described. If not, the selection criteria for patients who entered different cohorts should be stated.

3. Discussion
   Because some important parameters, such as pTNM and venous infiltration status, can only be obtained in postoperative histological examination, this model might be of limitation for its utility in patients who accept potentially curative therapies (for example, locoregional ablative therapies) without resected samples. This limitation might be stated and discussed in Discussion.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.