Reviewer's report

Title: Predicting time to progression and response to second-line trastuzumab-based therapy in Her2-positive advanced breast cancer

Version: 1 Date: 18 July 2009

Reviewer: Reiki Nishimura

Reviewer's report:

The authors reported that none of the variables investigated correlated with the activity of the second-line therapy. Even though the viewpoint was interesting, there were no new findings in this manuscript. Therefore, if possible, further study is necessary.

1. OS was significantly associated with the clinical benefits from first-line therapy, so we want to know the useful predictive factors for first-line therapy.

2. Disease-free interval and the metastatic site such as soft tissues, bone and viscera are important factors in evaluating the efficacy of the treatment in recurrent cases. The authors should add these factors in the investigating variables.

3. We would like to know the results of the univariate analyses and the hazard ratio in Tables 3 and 4.

4. Did the authors treat ER positive-patients with endocrine therapy? If so, what kind of endocrine therapies did they use in combination with trastuzumab?

5. “Endocrine receptor” should be changed to “estrogen receptor”.

6. We would like to know the response rate of re-challenging using trastuzumab.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.